DELEGATED

AGENDA NO
PLANNING COMMITTEE

Date 9th January 2008

REPORT OF CORPORATE DIRECTOR, DEVELOPMENT AND NEIGHBOURHOOD SERVICES

07/2851/FUL

Land at New Road, Billingham

Creation of Eco Park including a waste transfer station, glass recycling plant, new access and associated landscaping.

Expiry Date 16 January 2008

SUMMARY

This full application relates to approximately 28.7 hectares of land (68.7 acres) originally part of the ICI Billingham complex (agricultural plant) and located north of New Road and east of Roscoe Road but is now vacant. The land is relatively flat apart from a grassed bank area along the south west of the site, which provides an element of screening from residential properties on Roscoe Road. There is also an area of dense trees and bushes on the western boundary, which provides further screening.

The application seeks to develop the area as an "Eco Park" for the processing and use of waste materials. The present application proposes a fairly modest first phase comprising of just two industries — waste transfer station and a glass recycling operation. In addition a new access from New Road to the site is proposed together with a landscaped screen bund.

Local residents and industrial occupiers have been consulted. Seven responses from residents have been received raising concerns about noise, smell, traffic and general adverse impact on their amenity as well as querying the appropriateness of the location. One industrial neighbour is concerned about the glass recycling facility being built over a fire main. The concerns of the neighbours are noted and can be largely overcome by the use of appropriate conditions.

No significant concerns have been raised from the statutory consultees though the views of the Head of Technical Services and the Environment Agency are still awaited.

The main planning considerations are the policy implications and principle of development, impact on the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring premises, noise, contamination, health and safety risk, access and highway safety considerations, and flood risk. These matters have been considered in detail and subject to the outstanding consultation responses it is considered that the scheme would provide a waste transfer and recycling facility, which will assist in the delivery of sustainable waste management in accordance with national, regional and local policy without any significant impact on local amenity.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that subject to the views of the Head of technical services and the Environment Agency application 07/2851/FUL be approved subject to conditions covering the following matters:

- Development carried out in accordance with the approved plans
- Dust suppression
- Car parking
- Landscaping details for the screen mound
- No burning of waste material
- No external storage of waste materials except in designated location
- Details of external lighting
- Regime for picking up litter or other windblown material
- Control of location and method of skip storage
- Sound insulation for the buildings
- Diversion of water main and hydrants prior to development commencing
- Carrying out a Phase 2 Environmental Risk survey and implementation of any necessary remediation works before commencement of development.
- Implementation of necessary safety measures during the construction phase of development
- Approval of details design and facing materials for the buildings reserved for future approval

•

The proposal has been considered against the policies below and. It is considered that the scheme would provide a waste transfer and recycling facility, which will assist in the delivery of sustainable waste management in accordance with national, regional and local policy without any significant impact on local amenity. In terms of the detail of the development, it is considered that the proposal accords local plan policies as it is a use appropriate to the industrial area, and subject to the outstanding views of the Head of Technical Services and the Environment Agency and the use of appropriate planning conditions the development is unlikely to have an adverse impact on the amenity of the occupants of neighbouring premises, visual amenity, access and highway safety, and flood risk, and there are no other material considerations which indicate a decision should be otherwise.

Regional Spatial Strategy
Policies 46 and 47
Adopted Stockton on Tees Local Plan (June 1997)
GP1 General Principles
IN7
EN34
EN35
EN36
EN37
PPS 1 "Delivering Sustainable Development"
PPG 4 "Industrial, commercial development and small firms
PPS 10 "Planning for Sustainable Waste Management"

PPGN 13 "Transport"

PPS 23 "Planning and Pollution Control"

Supplementary Planning Document 3: Parking Provision in New Developments

PROPOSAL

- This full application relates to approximately 28.7 hectares of land (68.7 acres) originally part of the ICI Billingham complex (agricultural plant) and located north of New Road and east of Roscoe Road. It is an irregular shaped area accessed at present from Chilton Avenue to the North West. A railway line runs through part of the site and around its southern and eastern boundaries.
- 2. As part of ICI it was used for heavy industry but is now vacant. Industry occupies the land to the north and includes hazardous industry as well the Nicholls Transport and storage site. The land is relatively flat apart from a grassed bank area along the south west of the site, which provides an element of screening from residential properties on Roscoe Road. There is also an area of dense trees and bushes on the western boundary, which provides further screening.
- 3. The application seeks to develop the area as an "Eco Park" which is described by the applicant as comprising "a collection of industries involved with the processing and use of waste materials". The present application proposes a fairly modest first phase comprising of just two industries waste transfer station and a glass recycling operation. In addition a new access from New Road to the site is proposed together with a landscaped screen bund.

Waste Transfer Station

- 4. The waste transfer station (WTS) is to be located on the western part of the site and will comprise a profiled metal clad building which will accommodate the recycling operations. A trommel (machine for helping sort the waste into various types) will be located within this building, which measures 60.5m x 40m with an eaves height of 10m. However, the elevations submitted with the application are only shown as indicative. A weighbridge and security office is also proposed together with a separate office building (20m x 15m) located north east of the main building.
- 5. The WTS will involve the management and recycling of municipal, industrial and commercial wastes arising in the Teesside area collected as part of a skip hire business. All recycling operations and processes will take place within the WTS with cardboard, scrap, plastic and timber removed and stockpiled prior to transporting to specialist companies. Soils metal and brick rubble would also be extracted and sorted. The predicted throughput is:
 - Import of waste material: 25,000 tonnes per annum
 - Export of recycled material: 25,000 tonnes per annum
- 6. The facility is intended replace an existing WTS at Grangetown in Redcar and Cleveland, which would be relocated to this site.
- 7. The day-to-day operation of the site would be controlled by the Environment Agency through its Waste Management Licence powers.

Glass Recycling

8. The proposed glass recycling facility is to located at the eastern end of the site and involves the construction of a series of buildings aimed at producing high quality glass granulates

- which will be chemically and physically inert, sharp free and easy to handle from green glass waste (predominately bottles).
- 9. Again the plans for this facility are only shown as indicative but the show a glass "cullet" (green glass waste) refinement facility (maximum height of 33m) with concrete loading bays, a storage and bagging facility with a maximum height of 18m linked by conveyers to the cullet facility, and external storage areas for both feedstock and bagged material. Parking for 20 cars with separate area for parking heavy plant is also indicated.
- 10. The predicted throughput is:
 - Imported waste glass: 50,000 tonnes per annum
 - Export of recycled product: 45,000 tonnes per annum
 - Export of waste material: 5,000 tonnes per annum

Access

11. In addition to the main buildings it is proposed to construct a new access off New Road to the south of the site together with a new gatehouse to serve as the main access to Eco Park. This access will link to an improved and extended internal road running north/south to serve the WTS which itself will link a new road running across the site serving the glass recycling facility. The existing access onto Chiltons Avenue is indicated on the plans as not to be used for HGV traffic. The submitted plans also indicate new rail sidings and it is stated that in the longer term it is intended the rail access "should play a full part in moving material in and out of the site" but for the purposes of assessing the current application the applicant accepts it must be assumed that at present, no use will be made of the railway.

Landscape bund

- 12. The application also proposes further screening at the south west of the site in the form of a landscaped bund and buffer. Its purpose is to screen the WTS from the back of neighbouring residential properties on Roscoe Road. In achieving this it will also screen the rest of the complex and other existing industry from view. The residential properties are some 120m distant to the west of the WTS and some 620m from the Glass Recycling facility.
- 13. The application is supported by a noise assessment, a transport statement, a phase one environmental risk assessment, a desk study for potential historic explosives and radiological contamination, a planning statement and a flood risk assessment.

CONSULTATIONS

14. The following Consultees were notified and any comments received are set out below:-

Environmental Health Unit

- 15. No objection in principle to the development, however, does have concerns regarding the following environmental issues and would recommend the conditions as detailed be imposed on the development should it be approved.
 - "Noise disturbance from plant

Before the plant is brought into use the buildings, structure and plant shall be insulated against the emission of noise in accordance with a scheme to be approved by the Local Planning Authority. Such noise insulation shall be thereafter maintained to the satisfaction of the Local Planning

Authority. Any new plant installed subsequent to the approval shall not increase background levels of noise as agreed without the agreement in writing of the Local Planning Authority.

Consideration should be given to restricting the hours of operation of vehicles on site - it is suggested that there shall be no vehicles operating on site outside the hours of 8am –6pm [mon – fri], 8am –12:00 [sat] with no Sunday /bank holiday working.

Possible land contamination

ENVIRONMENTAL RISK ASSESSMENT PHASE 2

If it is likely that contamination is present, no development shall commence until a Phase 2 site investigation scheme to involve risk estimation has been carried out. The developer must design and implement intrusive investigations to provide sufficient information on potential contamination.

Reason: To ensure the proper restoration of the site.

C408 - Remediation and validation

No development hereby approved shall commence on site until a remediation scheme to deal with contamination of the site has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This scheme shall identify and evaluate options for remedial treatment based on risk management objectives. No Development hereby approved shall commence until the measures approved in the remediation scheme have been implemented on site, following which, a validation report shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The validation report shall include programmes of monitoring and maintenance, which will be carried out in accordance with the requirements of the report.

Reason: To ensure the proper restoration of the site.

Open burning

No waste products derived as a result of carrying out the business hereby approved shall be burned on the site except in a properly constructed appliance of a type and design previously approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Dust emissions

Any dust emissions from material less than 7.5mm in diameter, stored, loaded or transported externally, shall be prevented by covering, sheeting or water suppression."

Urban Design (Engineers, landscape and built environment)

16. Views awaited

The Environment Agency

17. Views awaited

Health and Safety Executive

18. Does not advise, on safety grounds, against the granting of planning permission in this case

Northern Gas Networks

19. No objections

NEDL

- 20. No concerns raised
- 21. No response has been received from
 - Care For Your Area
 - Northumbrian Water Limited
 - Highways Agency

PUBLICITY

22. Neighbours were notified and the application was advertised on site and in the press. The neighbour comments received are set out below:-

Mrs Bolton, 43 Imperial Road' Billingham

Does not see why we want to have more works so near. It should be put where the other tip is as is there is plenty of room and the road can go right to it.

Rachel Mullen, 36 New Road' Billingham

Objects to the proposal due to increase in noise, traffic and pollution in the area. There is an existing recycling plant further away from the residential area at Haverton Hill which has adequate access and will remove the smell, traffic and noise from the residential area.

Mrs D O'Shea, 31 Mill Lane' Billingham

Lived here for over 46 years and seen her property devalued for a variety of reasons. She does not want a waste plant at the end of her street and considers that there are other areas where it could be built not close to housing

J O'Shea, 44 Mill Lane' Billingham

The objector is a disabled person and is concerned that they might be confined to the house with heavy traffic all day and an eyesore of a plant a stones throw away. Describing it as an eco park is just window dressing. There is an eco park at Billingham Bottoms

Mr and Mrs E Hammond. 41 Imperial Road' Billingham

Wants to say no to a Waste Transfer station for New Road. Put up with industrial works noise and dirt for years and feels this new build will increase traffic and disruption for the area. It should be built elsewhere away from people's homes.

George Coleman, 47 Imperial Road' Billingham

Is concerned that it is to be on a greenfield site a Billingham Bottoms and if so it would be disgrace. It seems that the location is being kept a secret. It should be on a brownfield site where all the waste and recycling plants could be kept together. Land is available at Haverton Hill.

Kathryn White, 49 Imperial Road' Billingham

Objects to the proposal as thinks it will encroach too much on the neighbouring housing. Also doesn't state what the waste will be or were it will come from and that we already have a waste recycling plant at Haverton Hill. Can't see why the applicant didn't apply to build it on the old shipyards site near to the existing recycling plant where it would not need a new access road. As to traffic as no wagons are allowed access onto New Road, where would they have their entrance?

Martyn Bainbridge, Dow Haltermann Limited' Custom Processing I C I Process Park, Haverton Hill Road

Initially objected as the proposed glass recycling plant was located immediately south of its chemical facility and was located on top of the fire main and at least one of the fire hydrant/monitors. The concern was being able to access essential safety equipment for operations and for maintenance.

After discussions with applicant's agent, the objection has been removed on the basis of the reassurances given by the applicant to Dow Haltermann that:

"Impetus undertake to not prejudice the supply of fire fighting water to neighbouring industry by either:-

- a) diverting the fire main and above ground hydrants at their expense (work to be carried out ahead of any development of the glass making plant) or
- b) submitting a revised siting to the Local Planning Authority prior to any works commencing on the site, taking account the position of the fire main"

PLANNING POLICY

23. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that if regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the planning Acts the determination must be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. In this case the relevant Development Plans are the Regional Spatial Strategy (RSS), Tees Valley Structure Plan (TVSP) and the Stockton on Tees Local Plan (STLP).

National Planning Policy

Waste Strategy 2007

- 24. In May 2007 the Government published its Waste Strategy 2007. This waste strategy and its Annexes, together with Planning Policy Statement 10 *Planning for Sustainable Waste Management* (PPS10) is part of the implementation for England of the requirements within the Framework Directive on Waste, and associated Directives, to produce waste management plans. These are the national level documents of a tiered system of waste planning in England, which together satisfies the requirements of the various Directives. At regional level there are Regional Spatial Strategies (RSSs), and at local level, development plan documents.
- 25. There is a particular requirement in the Waste Framework Directive for the waste management plans to identify suitable disposal sites or installations. PPS10 sets out relevant national policies for waste management facilities, including location criteria to inform local planning policy and planning decisions. Local Planning Authorities in England

have an obligation under the Waste Management Licensing Regulations 19945 to produce detailed policies in respect of suitable disposal sites or installations for waste management purposes when producing local development documents, and also to have regard to national policies and to this strategy. PPS10 provides that local planning authorities should, among other things, identify in development plan documents sites and areas suitable for new or enhanced waste management facilities for the waste management needs of their areas, and, in particular, allocate sites to support the pattern of waste management facilities set out in the RSS (in accordance with the broad locations identified in the RSS).

- 26. This White Paper replaces the previous waste strategy for England (Waste Strategy 2000).
- 27. National Planning policies are set out in Planning Policy Guidance Notes (PPG) and the newer Planning Policy Statements (PPS).
- 28. Relevant to this application are:

PPS 1 "Delivering Sustainable Development"

PPG 4 "Industrial, commercial development and small firms

PPS 10 "Planning for Sustainable Waste Management"

PPGN 13 "Transport"

PPS 23 "Planning and Pollution Control"

Regional Spatial Strategy

29. The draft revision to the Regional Spatial Strategy and the proposed changes by the Secretary of State issued May 2007 gives consideration to sustainable waste management. It includes a number of relevant policies – policies 46 (Sustainable Waste Management) and 47 (Waste Management Provision).

Policy 46 – Sustainable Waste Management

Strategies, plans and programmes, and planning proposals should give priority to initiatives, which encourage behavioural change through:

- a) Developing and implementing waste minimisation plans and schemes;
- b) Implementing waste awareness and education campaigns,
- c) Developing reuse schemes; and
- d) Minimising the use of primary construction materials and the production of waste,

And should be based on the following key principles:

- a) The waste hierarchy with minimization at the top, then reuse, recycling, composting, waste to energy and landfill,
- b) Enable waste to be disposed of in one of the nearest appropriate installations;
- c) Ensuring communities take more responsibility for their own waste.

Policy 47 – Waste Management Provision

Strategies, plans and programmes should provide the management capacity for the annual tonnage of waste arisings set out in Table 3 & 3A. The type and number of facilities should reflect local circumstances within the strategic framework established by RSS policies and will be based on:

- Household Waste to increase recycling and composting to 33% by 2015
- Municipal Solid Waste to increase recovery to 72% by 2016

- Commercial & Industrial to increase recovery to 73% by 2016
- Construction & Demolition to increase recycling to 80% by 2016

Adopted Tees Valley Structure Plan (February 2004)

30. The Tees Valley Structure Plan indicates the development is in an area broadly identified for potentially polluting or hazardous industrial development (Policy EMP 10 and sets out environmental controls in policies ENV 27 and ENV 28). However, these are not "saved policies" and are therefore no longer relevant to this proposal.

Adopted Stockton on Tees Local Plan (June 1997)

31. There are a number of policies within the adopted Stockton on Tees Local Plan, which are relevant to the present proposal and site. These include Policy IN7, which permits within the ICI process plant park, general, potentially polluting or hazardous industrial and warehousing uses and hazardous installations may be permitted (except on that part of the site closest to Roscoe Road where only business, general industrial and warehousing i.e. B 1, B2 and B8 uses will be permitted), provided that they do not significantly affect the amenity of nearby residents or employees of and visitors to neighbouring businesses, and provided in relation to hazardous installations that they meet the criteria outlined in policies EN 36 and EN 37 relating to new hazardous development. Policies EN34 and EN35 relate to development of sites that are either contaminated or in the vicinity of contaminated sites and establish criteria against which such developments will be permitted.

MATERIAL PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

32. The main planning considerations are the policy implications and principle of development, impact on the amenity of occupiers of neighbouring premises, noise, contamination, health and safety risk, access and highway safety considerations, and flood risk.

Policy Implications and Principle of Development

- 33. The application is allocated in the adopted Stockton on Tees Local Plan for industrial purposes on a brownfield site previously used for heavy industry including potentially hazardous operations. Neither of the uses is deemed hazardous and in view of the process and the likely environmental impacts arising, it is considered that these uses suitably controlled, are appropriate in principle in this location.
- 34. Furthermore the provision of a waste transfer station and glass recycling facility will assist in the delivery of sustainable waste management in accordance with national and local policy.

Impact on the Amenity of Occupiers of Neighbouring Premises

35. The application site is within an existing industrial area and both the waste transfer and recycling process takes place within a building. There will potentially be some outside storage of skips at the WTS but the location and method of such storage can be controlled by conditions. Waste handling activities if not contained within buildings can also often give rise to litter, to be found mostly along fence lines and in vegetation. This in turn degrades the appearance of the site and the immediate area generally. Conditions can again be imposed both to contain operations to within the building and to ensure that litter picking is undertaken on a regular basis.

- 36. The WTS building will be totally screened from view by occupants of residential properties on Roscoe Road by the proposed landscape mound. Whilst the views of the Landscape Officer are still awaited on this aspect of the development, the early implementation of this element of the proposal can be secured by condition. Given the provision of this feature and the separation distance of over 100m, it is considered there will be little or no visual impact detrimentally affecting residents in Roscoe Road and elsewhere. Similarly there will be outdoor storage at the glass recycling plant but given the distances involved there will be little or no visual impact outside of the site.
- 37. Residents in the general are concerned about noise, smell, pollution, traffic and general disturbance. Issues relating noise and traffic are discussed further below. In relation to smell and pollution the types of waste handled at both facilities are dry wastes and do not involve putrescible materials that are likely to give rise to any concerns over odour. It is noted that the Environmental Health Officer has not requested any conditions regarding odour control. However, the measures proposed to prevent open burning and dust emissions are appropriate and can be conditioned accordingly.
- 38. In respect of overall disturbance there will be general movement of vehicles and personnel are as to be expected at this type of premises but given:
 - the avoidance of the use of the Chiltons Avenue entrance which would involve vehicles passing residential properties,
 - the weight restriction (7.5 tonne) order prohibiting through traffic above this weight west of the New Road junction,
 - the limited number of vehicle trips estimated (see below) and
 - the distance the facilities are from residential properties in New Road, Imperial Avenue and Mill Lane,

Any disturbance would not be significant enough to warrant a refusal of permission. Immediate neighbouring occupiers are either industrial or Chemical, or storage and distribution.

39. In light of the above, it is unlikely, given the potentially limited environmental impacts and the controls that are available, that the proposed development would have an adverse impact on the amenity of neighbouring occupiers in terms of odour, pollution and general disturbance.

Noise

- 40. A Noise Assessment prepared by consultants supports the application. It compares predicted noise levels with the measured baseline noise levels from Roscoe Road. It concludes that any noise impact will either be insignificant or of minor significance (i.e. 1dB(A)) more than measured background noise) and therefore unlikely to lead to justified noise complaints. In mitigation the assessment also notes that:
 - the WTS has been designed so that all openings face east away the noise sensitive receptors on Roscoe Road
 - the externals cladding of the buildings provide acoustic attenuation, and
 - the landscape mound on the western will act as an acoustic screen
- 41. Environmental Health has also recommended sound insulation for the building and this can be secured by planning condition. It has also suggested that consideration should be given

- to the restriction to the hours of operations of vehicles on the site. However, this is not considered justified given the low level of noise predicted as well as recognising existing industrial operations on the site are not subject to such restrictions.
- 42. In conclusion it is considered that the development will not result in any significant increase in noise pollution in the area.

Contamination

43. Given its past industrial history the site is likely to be contaminated. The application is accompanied with a Phase 1 Environmental Risk Assessment, which similarly concludes there is a risk of contamination. Planning policy requires the site to be remediated before new development commences. The Environmental Health Officer recommends that a Phase 2 Assessment be carried out and that no development commences until a remediation scheme has been agreed and satisfactorily implemented. These matters can be required by planning conditions.

Health and Safety Risk

44. The application is accompanied by a desk study for potential historic explosives and radiological contamination because of concerns that the site was heavily bombed in the war and also has a potential for some radiological contamination. The study advises on safety precautions to be taken in carrying out development on the site. Appropriate conditions can be attached to any permission to cover this concern. The Health and Safety Executive has no objections to the proposal.

Access and Highway Safety Considerations

- 45. The impact of traffic on the amenities of the area is of concern to local residents as well as for your officers. The applicant's transport consultant envisages that, at maximum, the development would generate 22 vehicle trips per hour and in its Transport Statement accompanying the application concludes that it will result in a slight increase in traffic on the road network but with only a marginal operational impact on the road network at the A10046, Haverton Hill Road/ New Road junction with the addition of development traffic.
- 46. The Head of Technical Services has yet to respond formally on the traffic issue but has been involved in protracted discussions with the applicant's consultant on this matter. It is understood that consensus over the likely impact and any necessary mitigation measures has nearly been reached. The matter will be fully set out in an update report to Committee. Consequently, it is not possible at this stage to comment as to whether the increase in traffic arising from the proposed development is acceptable from the highway standpoint.
- 47. No response from the Highways Agency on this proposal has been received.

Flood Risk

48. Because the application site is within 500m of Billingham Beck the applicant has submitted a Flood Risk Assessment. This concludes that the scheme may lead to an increase in the level of hard surfacing at the site but it is not at risk of flooding. The drainage design and drainage arrangements that will be put in place will eliminate, it is claimed "the risk of land, groundwater and sewer flooding". The views of the Environment Agency are still awaited and its comment will set out in the update report to be prepared.

Residual matters

49. The concerns raised by Dow Haltermann concerning the potential impact of the development on an existing fire main appear to have been resolved in its discussions with the applicant's planning consultant. However, as the application is in full (though the applicant has requested details of the glass recovery plant be reserved for future approval) this matter is best dealt with a condition of approval that before any development commences the fire main shall be diverted to the satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority.

CONCLUSION

50. The proposal has been considered against the policies set out above, the consultation responses and the concerns raised by local residents and industrial occupiers. It is considered that the scheme would provide a waste transfer and recycling facility, which will assist in the delivery of sustainable waste management in accordance with national, regional and local policy without any significant impact on local amenity. In terms of the detail of the development, it is considered that the proposal accords local plan policies as it is a use appropriate to the industrial area, and subject to the outstanding views of the Head of Technical Services and the Environment Agency and the use of appropriate planning conditions the development is unlikely to have an adverse impact on the amenity of the occupants of neighbouring premises, visual amenity, access and highway safety, and flood risk, and there are no other material considerations which indicate a decision should be otherwise.

Corporate Director of Development and Neighbourhood Services Contact Officer Mr Peter Whaley Telephone No 01642 526061

Financial Implications

As report

Environmental Implications

As Report

Legal Implications

As report

Community Safety Implications

As Reported

Human Rights Implications

The provisions of the European Convention of Human Rights 1950 have been taken into account in the preparation of this report.

Background Papers

- Planning Application File 07/2851/FUL
- Planning Policy Statements 1, 4, 10 and 23 and Guidance Note No 13
- Waste Strategy 2007
- Regional Spatial Strategy for the North East The Secretary of State's Proposed Changes to the Draft Revision by the North East Assembly (May 2007)

• Adopted Stockton on Tees Local Plan (June 1997) policies GP 1, IN7

WARD AND WARD COUNCILLORS

Ward

Billingham South Councillor Mrs J. O' Donnell **Ward Councillor**

Billingham South Councillor M. Smith Ward **Ward Councillor**